

Youth-Soccer Evaluation Forms

Developed by Will Thalheimer, PhD
(October 2012, Reviewed again in November 2017)

Note from Will:

Player evaluation is not as easy as it might look. As a youth soccer coach for many years I have struggled to evaluate my own players and have seen how my soccer league evaluates players to place them on teams. As a professional learning-and-performance consultant who has focused extensively on measurement and evaluation, I think we can all do better, me included. To this end, I have spent the last two years creating a series of evaluation tools for use by coaches and youth soccer leagues. I'm sure these forms are not perfect, but I'm absolutely positive that they will be a huge improvement over the typical forms utilized by most youth soccer organizations.

The Goal:

The four forms enable soccer coaches (and/or other evaluators) to evaluate the skills of youth soccer players.

Why Evaluate?

Evaluation is critical for a number of reasons. First, evaluation can help in team selection and recruitment. Evaluation can help coaches look for skill-development opportunities for their teams and individual players. Finally, evaluation can be used as a baseline to help players focus on their own development.

The Four Forms:

1. Player Ranking Form: This form evaluates players on 26 soccer competencies and 4 player-comparison items, giving each player a numerical score based on these items AND an overall rating. This form is intended to provide leagues with ranking information so that they can better place players on teams for the upcoming season.

2. Player Development Form: This form evaluates players on the 26 soccer competencies. This form is intended for use by coaches to help support their players in development. Indeed, this form can be shared with players and parents to help players focus on their development needs.

3. Team Evaluation Form: This form helps coaches use practices and games to evaluate their players on the 26 key competencies. Specifically, it enables them to use one two-page form to evaluate every player on their team.

4. Field Evaluation Form: This form enables skilled evaluators to judge the performance of players during small-group scrimmages. Like the Player Ranking Form, it provides player-comparison information to leagues.

The forms are available here:

<https://www.worklearning.com/2012/09/26/a-better-youth-soccer-evaluation-form/>

Common Mistakes: While no evaluation tool is perfect, it is helpful to avoid the most common mistakes in evaluation. Here is a list of common mistakes in youth soccer evaluation:

1. **When skills evaluated are not clear to evaluators.** So for example, having players rated on their “agility” will not provide good data because “agility” will likely mean different things to different people.
2. **When skills are evaluated along too many dimensions.** So for example, evaluating a player on their “ball-handling skills, speed, and stamina” covers too many dimensions at once—a player could have excellent ball-handling skills but have terrible stamina.
3. **When the rating scales that evaluators are asked to use make it hard to select between different levels of competence.** So for example, while “ball-handling” might reasonably be evaluated, it may be hard for an evaluator to determine whether a player is excellent, very good, average, fair, or poor in ball-handling. Generally, it is better to have clear criteria and ask whether or not a player meets those criteria. Four or Five-Point scales are not recommended.
4. **When evaluators can’t assess skills because of the speed of action, the large number of players involved, or the difficulty of noticing the skills targeted.** For example, evaluations of scrimmages that involve more than four players on a side make it extremely difficult for the evaluators to notice the contributions of each player.
5. **When bias affects evaluators’ judgments.** Because the human mind is always working subconsciously, biases can be easily introduced. So for example, it is bad practice to give evaluators the coaches’ ratings of players before those players take part in a scrimmage-based evaluation.
6. **When bias leads to a generalized positive or negative evaluation.** Because evaluation is difficult and is largely a subconscious process, a first impression can skew an evaluation away from what is valid. For example, when a player is seen as getting outplayed in the first few minutes of a scrimmage, his/her later excellent play may be ignored or downplayed. Similarly, when a player is intimidated early in the season, a coach may not fully notice his/her gritty determination later in the year.
7. **When bias comes from too few observations.** Because evaluation is an inexact process, evaluation results are likely to be more valid if the evaluation utilizes (a) more observations (b) by more evaluators (c) focusing on more varied soccer situations. Coaches who see their players over time and in many soccer situations are less likely to suffer from bias, although they too have to watch out that their first impressions don’t cloud their judgments. And of course, it is helpful to get assessments beyond one or two coaches.
8. **When players are either paired with, or are playing against, players who are unrepresentative of realistic competition.** For example, players who are paired against really weak players may look strong in comparison. Players who are paired as teammates with really good players may look strong because of their teammates’ strong play. Finally, players who only have experience playing weaker players may not play well when being evaluated against stronger players even though they might be expected to improve by moving up and gaining experience with those same players.

9. **When the wrong things are evaluated.** Obviously, it's critical to evaluate the right soccer skills. So for example, evaluating a player on how well he/she can pass to a stationary player is not as valid as seeing whether good passes are made in realistic game-like situations when players are moving around. The more game-like the situations, the better the evaluation.
10. **When evaluations are done by remembering, not observing.** Many coaches fill out their evaluation forms back home late at night instead of evaluating their players while observing them. The problem with this memory-based approach is that it introduces huge biases into the process. First, memory is not perfect, so evaluators may not remember correctly. Second, memory is selective. We remember some things and forget others. Players must be evaluated primarily through observation, not memory.
11. **Encouraging players to compare themselves to others.** As coaches, one of our main goals is to help our players learn to develop their skills as players, as teammates, as people, and as thinkers. Unfortunately, when players focus on how well they are doing in comparison to others, they are less likely to focus on their own skill development. It is generally a mistake to use evaluations to encourage players to compare themselves to others. While players may be inclined to compare themselves to others, coaches can limit the negative effects of this by having each player focus on their own key competencies to improve.
12. **Encouraging players to focus on how good they are overall, instead of having them focus on what they are good at and what they still have to work on.** For our players to get better, they have to put effort into getting better. If they believe their skills are fixed and not easily changed, they will have no motivation to put any effort into their own improvement. Evaluations should be designed NOT to put kids in categories (except when absolutely necessary for team assignments and the like), but rather to show them what they need to work on to get better. As coaches, we should teach the importance of giving effort to deliberate practice, encouraging our players to refine and speed their best skills and improve on their weakest skills.
13. **Encouraging players to focus on too many improvements at once.** To help our players (a) avoid frustration, (b) avoid thinking of themselves as poor players, and (c) avoid overwhelming their ability to focus, we ought to have them only focus on a few major self-improvement goals at one time.

Form Design Goals: The goal of any skill evaluation is to get a true indication of the level of skills that an individual possesses. While it is impossible to reach a level of perfection in any evaluation, the goal is to have an evaluation that (a) provides a reasonably true indication of skill level, (b) is relatively easy to administer and score, (c) seems reasonably fair to all involved, and (d) minimizes the biases that are typical in human judgment.

Note that these various goals often have to be balanced against each other. For example, while a longer form might provide a more comprehensive indication of abilities, it might be too onerous to fill out. While a simple form might be easy to use, it might not seem fair to those who get lower evaluation results.

Rest of Document:

The rest of this document simply introduces the four forms. For those of you who would rather just look at a form and use it, you should feel free.

I offer more details below for those of you who want to know the rationale for each form, get specific hints about how to use each form, or need to have background so you can advocate for a new evaluation approach for your league or your team.

I do recommend you at least skim the following pages so that you gain a quick understanding for why all four forms are needed—depending on what you're trying to accomplish.

Use of Forms:

Anyone, anywhere, at any time can use the forms I've developed. You can modify them or use them exactly as is. You can modify and sell them if you can find buyers. What you CANNOT do is copyright them so that others can't use them. The goal is to improve youth soccer evaluation, so feel free to make good use of them.

I will post both PDF's (so that you can see what they are supposed to look like regardless of your computer configuration) and Word documents (so that you can modify them if you like). Also, please consider sending me feedback and sharing your improvements. I can be reached at info@work-learning.com.

You can also reach me at that same email address or you can visit my website www.worklearning.com to check my credentials or ask me to consult for your organization.

The web page where these forms reside is:

<https://www.worklearning.com/2012/09/26/a-better-youth-soccer-evaluation-form/>

Note from Will in November 2017:

Although my work is in the workplace learning field, the blog post that includes these youth-soccer evaluation forms regularly rates as one of the most popular posts on my blog, often receiving over 2000 unique visitors per year.

Player Ranking Form

Player Ranking Form	Player:	Current Team:	Date of Review:
Watch the Player in Action. Does the player do the following?			
Fundamentals		Circle One	
Almost always inbounds the ball legally and toward a teammate.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
While using dominant foot in kicking toward goal, routinely kicks strongly.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely kicks and passes accurately with the inside of the foot.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely receives passed ball with cushioning and/or controlling it.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always avoids kicking ball into dangerous position in front of own net.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely keeps control of the dribble—not kicking it too far & not losing it too easily.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Advanced Fundamentals		Circle One	
While dribbling, routinely keeps head up to survey field for threats and opportunities.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Avoids kicking the ball away without a purpose & avoids kicking it to other team.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always plays in the correct field position (for his/her assigned position).	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always makes quick decisions when in control of the ball.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely looks for open players to pass to and makes well-timed & well-placed passes.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely utilizes non-dominant foot in kicking and passing.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Strategic and Tactical Play		Circle One	
Routinely dribbles the ball to a field location that strengthens his/her team's position.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely moves to field location without the ball that strengthens team's position.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely anticipates opponents' counter-attacking opportunities and prevents them.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always takes responsibility to control the flow of the game.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely moves ball to spot that entices opponent to over-commit to defensive move.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Routinely expends extra energy in key situations & finds ways to save energy safely.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
While on sideline almost always watches game to find opportunities to take advantage.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Focus and Hustle		Circle One	
Almost always stays focused on the game while playing.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always hustles quickly toward the play.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always recovers quickly after frustrations, disappointments, and minor bumps.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always avoids being intimidated by opposing players and pressure situations.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Improvement Potential		Circle One	
Almost always follows coach's suggestions for improvement.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always working with extra effort to improve his/her weakest skills.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Almost always gets along and avoids distractions with teammates, coaches, opponents.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Athleticism and Results		Circle One	
Is one of the top 3 fastest players on the team.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Is one of the top 3 in having endurance to keep running and playing with energy.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Is one of the top 3 in helping our team score goals—in getting goals and assists.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Is one of the top 3 in helping our team stop opponents' goal-scoring opportunities.	Yes (2)	Maybe (1)	No (0)
Add up Totals (Yes = 2, Maybe =1). How many points out of 60?		Points: _____	
Player's Final Ranking Score			
1. Superior -- Player almost always outplays others at this level	RANK (1 to 5): _____		
2. Very Good -- Player regularly outplays others at this level			
3. Average -- Player is equally likely to outplay and to be outplayed			
4. Weak -- Player is regularly outplayed by others at this level			
5. Very Weak -- Player is almost always outplayed by others at this level			
Coach/Evaluator Comments			

Player Ranking Form, by Will Thalheimer, Version 2.0, October 2012 - Use this form to provide ranking information to your league. Do NOT share this form with your players. Use Player Development Form for that!

Use For:

- Rating Players Numerically to Compare Them with Others.
- Use to Provide Your League with Player Ratings, either Using This Form Itself, or Using It Before Finalizing Your Player Rating and Then Submitting Results Using Your League's Official Form.

Do NOT Use For:

- Helping Your Players Develop.
- Sharing with Players/Parents.

How to Use:

- First Use the TEAM REVIEW FORM while Observing Your Players in Practice and in Games.
- Then for Each Player, Transfer Your Findings to This Form.
- For Each Player, Calculate Points. Review Team Results. Calculate Each Player's Final Ranking Score.

Details

Note that for each item, you should determine whether the player has met the criterion. You may choose "Yes," "No," or "Maybe." I added a "Maybe" column because I found when pilot testing the form that sometimes I wasn't sure whether the player really deserved a "Yes." You should feel free to use the "Maybe" column when you're not sure, or when a player substantially, but not fully, meets the criterion.

Obviously, the final score you obtain is an approximation of a player's true competence at that particular point in time. This is not an exact science. I found that it was helpful to do every player's score first, and then look at all the players' scores in comparison, and make a few minor adjustments after seeing the big picture. The advantage of doing everyone's score individually is that it reduces bias. I found that I actually learned a great deal about my own players by rating each person on each competency. Some people who I thought were better players (because of their athleticism and aggressiveness) actually lacked a number of skills (passing and teamwork) that I might not have noticed without the form.

The reason this form is NOT recommended to help you help your players develop is that the numerical values, the 4 player-comparison items, and the player's final ranking score will push players to think about how they compare to others and will make it less likely that they focus on their own development and the effort they will have to put into getting better.

Player Development Form

Player Development Form	Player Name:	Date of Review:		
Watch the Player in Action. Does the player do the following?				
Fundamentals		Circle One		
Almost always inbounds the ball legally and toward a teammate.	Yes	Maybe	No	
While using dominant foot in kicking toward goal, routinely kicks strongly.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely kicks and passes accurately with the inside of the foot.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely receives passed ball by cushioning and/or controlling it.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always avoids kicking ball into dangerous position in front of own net.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely keeps control of the dribble—not kicking it too far & not losing it too easily.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Advanced Fundamentals		Circle One		
While dribbling, routinely keeps head up to survey field for threats and opportunities.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Avoids kicking the ball away without a purpose & avoids kicking it to other team.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always plays in the correct field position (for his/her assigned position).	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always makes quick decisions when in control of the ball.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely looks for open players to pass to and makes well-timed & well-placed passes.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely utilizes non-dominant foot in kicking and passing.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Strategic and Tactical Play		Circle One		
Routinely dribbles the ball to a field location that strengthens his/her team's position.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely moves to field location without the ball that strengthens team's position.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely anticipates opponents' counter-attacking opportunities and prevents them.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always takes responsibility to control the flow of the game.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely moves ball to spot that entices opponent to over-commit to defensive move.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Routinely expends extra energy in key situations & finds ways to save energy safely.	Yes	Maybe	No	
While on sideline almost always watches game to find opportunities to take advantage.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Focus and Hustle		Circle One		
Almost always stays focused on the game while playing.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always hustles quickly toward the play.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always recovers quickly after frustrations, disappointments, and minor bumps.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always avoids being intimidated by opposing players and pressure situations.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Improvement Potential		Circle One		
Almost always follows coach's suggestions for improvement.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always working with extra effort to improve his/her weakest skills.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Almost always gets along and avoids distractions with teammates, coaches, opponents.	Yes	Maybe	No	
Coaches Suggestions for How to Improve				
1.				
2.				
3.				

Player Development Form, by Will Thalheimer, Version 2.0, October 2012 -- Use this form to help your players focus on what they need to improve. Feel free to share with player/parents. Repeat at regular intervals.

Use For:

- Helping Your Players Develop.
- Providing Your Players/Parents with a Form to Help them Self-Direct Their Own Development.

Do NOT Use For:

- Comparing Players or Providing Ratings of Players

How to Use:

- First Use the **TEAM REVIEW FORM** while Observing Your Players in Practice and in Games.
- Then for Each Player, Transfer Your Findings to This Form.
- For Each Player, Determine Three Skills He/She Can Learn to Improve.
- Provide Player with Goals for Improvement and Suggestions for How to Improve, Including Suggestions for Practice and Self-Study.

Details

Note that for each item, you should determine whether the player has met the criterion. You may choose "Yes," "No," or "Maybe." I added a "Maybe" column because I found when pilot testing the form that sometimes I wasn't sure whether the player really deserved a "Yes." You should feel free to use the "Maybe" column when you're not sure or when a player substantially, but not fully, meets the criterion.

Realize that the results of this form represent a snapshot in time. Ideally, you as a coach are trying to help your players improve. Consider using the form twice during the season, once early and once late.

Consider sharing this form with your players. This may seem odd at first because we are not used to providing this kind of feedback to our players, but it is an excellent way to get your players to think on their own about how they can develop their skills. When providing feedback, make it an individual event. Pull each player aside during a practice and explain the results, telling them that you're giving them the feedback so that they know what to focus their attention on. Ask them if there is anything else they want to work on. Don't make this a one-time discussion, but bring up their improvement goals periodically. Consider even separating your players during practice to work on different skills. For example, one group may work on passing, one on scoring goals, and one on moving to an open space. Consider giving them a choice on what to work on—to increase their motivation.

Team Evaluation Form

Team Review Form	Team Name:	Reviewer:	Date of Review:	
Watch Players in Action. Put First Names of Players into Cells at Right:				
Fundamentals				
Almost always inbounds the ball legally and toward a teammate.				
While using dominant foot in kicking toward goal, routinely kicks strongly.				
Routinely kicks and passes accurately with the inside of the foot.				
Routinely receives passed ball by cushioning and/or controlling it.				
Almost always avoids kicking ball into dangerous position in front of own net.				
Routinely keeps control of the dribble—not kicking it too far & not losing it too easily.				
Advanced Fundamentals				
While dribbling, routinely keeps head up to survey field for threats and opportunities.				
Avoids kicking the ball away without a purpose & avoids kicking it to other team.				
Almost always plays in the correct field position (for his/her assigned position).				
Almost always makes quick decisions when in control of the ball.				
Routinely looks for open players to pass to and makes well-timed & well-placed passes.				
Routinely utilizes non-dominant foot in kicking and passing.				

Team Review Form, by Bill Thrasher, Version 2.0, October 2012. Use this to help your players improve. Use with clipboard while watching your players in practice and in games. Don't show them this form! Comparisons are NOT helpful. Thanks to Player Development Form. Continue to Second Page...

Watch Players in Action. Put First Names of Players into Cells at Right:				
Strategic and Tactical Play				
Routinely dribbles the ball to a field location that strengthens his/her team's position.				
Routinely moves to field location without the ball that strengthens team's position.				
Routinely anticipates opponents' counter-attacking opportunities and prevents them.				
Almost always takes responsibility to control the flow of the game.				
Routinely moves ball to spot that entices opponent to over-commit to defensive move.				
Routinely expends extra energy in key situations & finds ways to save energy safely.				
While on sideline almost always watches game to find opportunities to take advantage.				
Focus and Hustle				
Almost always stays focused on the game while playing.				
Almost always hustles quickly toward the play.				
Almost always recovers quickly after frustrations, disappointments, and minor bumps.				
Almost always avoids being intimidated by opposing players and pressure situations.				
Improvement Potential				
Almost always follows coach's suggestions for improvement.				
Almost always working with extra effort to improve his/her weakest skills.				
Almost always gets along and avoids distractions with teammates, coaches, opponents.				

Team Review Form, by Bill Thrasher, Version 2.0, October 2012. Use this to help your players improve. Use with clipboard while watching your players in practice and in games. Don't show them this form! Comparisons are NOT helpful. Thanks to Player Development Form.

Use For:

- Observing Your Players in Practice and in Games to evaluate them on the 26 soccer competencies.

Do NOT Use For:

- Sharing with Players/Parents.

How to Use:

- Observe your players in practice and in games.
- Note that you will probably want to do this over several games and practices.
- Ideally, use more than one coach to complete this form. Later, compare notes and agree on the final assessment of each player.
- When you are done, Transfer Your Findings to the Player Development Form and/or the Player Ranking Form.
- **IMPORTANT NOTE: This is difficult to do. You will find that sometimes you are not sure. That is okay. Remember that by looking at the individual skills you will be creating a more valid evaluation.**

Details

This form will keep you from going crazy. If you try to use the individual player forms to assess each player, you will either have to do it from memory (a poor method because it creates bias) or you will pull your hair out shuffling papers during practice and you'll miss seeing those short moments of truth when you'll notice someone performing or not performing a soccer skill.

It is highly recommended that you print out this two-page form using the duplex setting of your printer (printing it on both sides of the page). This will make it easier to manage with a clipboard while you're making your observations.

You will likely feel overwhelmed at first when you do this. Just go with the flow. Even if you only do a mediocre job noticing your players' skills, you'll create a better evaluation than if you try to just rate the players without looking at their specific skills. Once you get used to this, you'll never go back.

Field Evaluation – Scrimmage Scoring Form

Field Evaluation – Scrimmage Scoring Form						
<i>Put Players in Teams of No-More-Than-Four on a Side. Use Only Skilled Evaluators (example: coaches)</i>						
Scrimmage Observations – Looking for these three skills:						
Controlling the Ball Keeping control of the dribble Knowing where and when to pass	Working with Teammates Passing to teammates Positioning self in open spaces		Focus and Hustle Hustles to be in the play Aggressive, not intimidated			
For each player, assign one of the following ratings. If you are NOT SURE, check off the "NOT SURE" box. Write Player Numbers Below: Likely Percentages:	I'm NOT SURE I didn't see or couldn't tell.	1 SUPERIOR Player almost always outplays others at this level	2 STRONG Player regularly outplays others at this level	3 AVERAGE Player is equally likely to outplay and to be outplayed	4 WEAK Player is regularly outplayed by others at this level	5 VERY WEAK Player is almost always outplayed by others at this level
Likely Percentages:		5%	25%	40%	25%	5%
Example Player:	74			✓		
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Player Number:						
Evaluator Signature:	Evaluator Name Printed:		Date:			

Field Evaluation Form, by Will Thalheimer, Version 2.0, October 2012 – Use form to rate players in scrimmages. Ensure sides are skill-balanced. Either avoid teammates or balance teammates. No more than 4 per side.

Use For:

- Evaluating large numbers of players during open scrimmages.
- Ratings from this form can be combined with ratings from the Player Ranking Form.

Do NOT Use For:

- Evaluating players on your team. This form is specifically for large group evaluations.

How to Use:

- Find skilled evaluators. Coaches are good. Give each of them a form, or several forms so they can evaluate players as they rotate through scrimmage stations.
- Set up two small goals at either end of a small field. Create teams of up to four players. Have them scrimmage. Move them around from offense to defense, pair them with different players, etc.

Details

Scrimmage evaluations are an excellent way to see players in a realistic soccer context. On the other hand, they create a difficult environment for evaluators to make detailed judgments of player skills. To help avoid bias, it's helpful to have multiple raters and move players around between positions and teammates. Another way to avoid bias is to remind raters to look for the three skills highlighted on the form, (1) Controlling the Ball, (2) Working with Teammates, and (3) Focus and Hustle. These three skills are relatively easy to observe—and are highly important. Moreover, by highlighting these three skills, you will reduce somewhat the kind of bias that comes from subjective evaluations. Finally, keep the number of players per team to a maximum of four so that evaluators can clearly observe soccer skills.

Note that goalies generally need not be used in goal. Goalies can bring more realism to a scrimmage, but the logistical challenges of having goalies usually outweigh their benefit. Using players in goal can make kids get different amounts of field-playing time. Perhaps you might consider having parents play goal.

Give players unique jersey numbers so that ratings can be easily compiled in an unbiased manner.

When combining field evaluation ratings with coach ratings to get a single rating, give much more weight to the coach evaluations, for example 70% for coach ratings and 30% for field evaluation ratings.